

## **CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES**

### **DATE: MARCH 12, 2015**

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, March 12, 2015. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, Mr. Robert Braddock, and Mr. C. Freeman McNeal. Commission staff present included Civil Service Secretary Georgetta Kelly, Civil Service Secretary, Recording Secretary Seeta Martindale, Assistant HR Director Nancy Olind, Senior Human Resources Analyst, Darrell Ludlow, and Human Resources Analysts, Ornita Brown, Bruce Ross, Erica Burks, Doris Adotey, Derrick Gentry, and Nosakhare Ekhatior.

### **AGENDA ITEMS**

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 2/26/2015 MEETING.** Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner McNeal made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Braddock seconded the motion and the minutes were unanimously approved.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:**

**Neil Greely to the position of Clerk Typist 1 in the Police Department.** This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

**Monica Cox to the position of Clerk Typist 1 in the Police Department.** This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

**Jacob Lipps to the position of Civil Engineering Technician 1 in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive**

**Marlena McCloud to the position of Medical Assistant in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

MARCH 12, 2015

**MINUTES** cont'd...

**Diana Anderson to the position of Zoning Plan Examiner (Building Plans Examiner) in the Department of City Planning and Buildings.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Beth Bryant to the position of Sanitarian in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and certification needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Craig Baurichter and Robert Scherbenberg to the position of Electrical Maintenance Helper in the Department of Water.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills, experience and training needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Eugene Lackey to the position of Assistant Supervisor of Inspections in the City Planning Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and certification needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Promotion**

**Notice from the Cincinnati Police Department of the promotion of (56) individuals from the position of Police Recruit to the rank of Police Officer.** Fifty-six new Police Officers were promoted from the 2012 Police Recruit (Open) exam process. These officers successfully completed the Cincinnati Police Academy's training program, received Ohio Peace Officer Training Academy Certifications, and were sworn in according to the guidelines outlined in the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract, on February 27, 2015. Below is a list of the names of the successful candidates:

James Ball  
Andrew Burkett  
Nicholas Casch  
Brandon Dean  
Antonio Evans  
Andrew Fischer  
Alexander Gettys  
Dave Harris  
Jesse Hooven

Quentin Bishop  
Clinton Bulter  
Matthew Croswell  
Robert Dews  
Sean Farris  
Brian Follrod  
Matthew Gramlich  
Adam Heine  
Derrick Johnson

Michelle Bockensette  
Molly Cajacob  
Todd Dawson  
Kenneth Dotson  
Brandon Fields  
Bradley Gettelfinger  
Charlene Hahn  
Robert Hemsink  
Corey Jones

MARCH 12, 2015

**MINUTES cont'd...**

Joseph Keating  
Cian McGrath  
William Nastold  
Ashley Nusbaum  
Takia Smith  
Jonce Tackett  
Jamie Ward  
William Webb  
Logan White  
John Wolff

Carrie Longworth  
Steven Mittermeier  
Janitta Nichols  
Terrill Saylor  
Matthew Spradlin  
Scott Traufler  
Tracy Ward  
Christopher Wermuth  
Kori Wilkins  
Andrew Yenco

Christopher Loreaux  
Kelly Moore  
Shayna Norman  
Marcus Sherman  
Steven Steverson  
Jason Wallace  
Abigail Waymire  
Troy Wesley  
Robert Wilsman

**Orlando Byrden to the position of Traffic Aids Worker in the Public Services Department.** This position was posted as an AFSCME Article XX promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Joseph Conley to the rank of Fire Lieutenant in the Fire Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order in accordance with the International Association of Fire Fighters (IAFF) Collective Bargaining Agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**John Rais to the rank of Fire Captain in the Fire Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order in accordance with the International Association of Fire Fighters (IAFF) Collective Bargaining Agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Joshlyn Calloway to the position of Senior Customer Relations Representative in the Department of Water and Sewers.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the AFSCME collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Joanne Niesen to the position of Senior Customer Relations Representative in the Department of Water and Sewers.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the AFSCME collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Anthony Seimer to the position of Senior Customer Relations Representative in the Department of Water and Sewers.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Jane Weber to the position of Senior Customer Relations Representative in the Department of Water and Sewers.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the AFSCME collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Joan Clark to the position of Water Customer Service Representative 1 in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the AFSCME collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Lela Moustafa to the position of Motor Equipment Operator 1 in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the AFSCME collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Ronnie Berry to the position of Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the CODE collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Mary Fliehman to the position of Senior Accountant in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the CODE collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Darryl Woods to the position of Senior Accountant in the Department of Sewers.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the promotional exam, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

#### **TEMPORARY PROMOTION**

**Andy Orth to the position of Supervising Engineer in the Department of Water.** The Department of Water has an urgent need to temporarily fill the position of Supervising Engineer and has selected Mr. Orth for the position. Mr. Orth possessed the specialized skills and experience, not possessed by other eligible candidates, to effectively manage and maintain the urgent operational needs of the department. In order to avoid serious operational problems, the Commission suspended the rotation requirement of other candidates through the position, in this instance, as requested by the agency and approved the temporary promotion.

#### **PROMOTION WITHOUT EXAM**

**Bradley Blankenship to the position of Plant Supervisor in the Department of Sewers.** The Plant Supervisor position was posted from January 15–28, 2015. Fewer than (10) applications were received by the Human Resources Department. Pursuant to Civil Service Rule 10 § 9 and in

accordance to the CODE Bargaining Agreement, the applications of all qualified candidates were forwarded to the department for consideration and interviews. The department selected Mr. Blankenship as the best-suited candidate for the position. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Working out of Class**

**Sheila Harris to the position of Service Area Coordinator in the Parks Department.** The candidate met the minimum qualifications of the position, the skills required to fulfill the current needs of the department, and was selected within the guidelines of the CODE contract to work out of class in the position of Service Area Coordinator. The Commission noted this item.

**Keith Heffner to the position of Treatment Supervisor (WWT) in the Departments of Water and Sewer.** The candidate met the minimum qualifications of the position, the specific skills and experience, and licensure required to fulfill the current needs of the department. The candidate was selected within the guidelines of the CODE bargaining contract to work out of class in the position of Treatment Supervisor (WWT). The Commission noted this item.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Re-instatement**

**Diana Hunter to the position of Utility Laborer in the Department of Water.** Due to a failed probation in the position of Plant Operator 1, Ms. Hunter is returning to the current vacant position in her former role as a Utility Laborer, in accordance to Civil Service Rule 9 § 6 and within the guidelines of AFSCME collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Transfer**

**Kathy Johnson to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Department of Water.** The Department of Sewers provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Department of Water. The candidate was selected based on the CODE contract from among the qualified applicants interested as meeting the specific skills needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Transfer and Voluntary Demotion**

**Request from the Police Department for the Transfer and Voluntary Demotion of Ms. Carla Ingram to the position of Clerk Typist 3 from the position of Operator and Dispatcher in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center.** The Clerk Typist 3 position was announced as a transfer opportunity in compliance with Article 20 of the AFSCME Collective Bargaining Agreement. The candidate applied for the Clerk Typist 3 position with the understanding that this action will require a voluntarily demotion from the position of an Operator and Dispatcher in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center. Since all parties were agreeable to the transfer and voluntary demotion, the Commission noted the transfer agreement and approved the voluntary demotion.

MARCH 12, 2015

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**ELIGIBLE LISTS: Request for Approval**

- a) Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor (MSD)
- b) Plant Operator 1 (Wastewater)
- c) Plant Operator 1 (Water)
- d) Automotive Mechanic

The Commission approved these items.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Exam Schedules**

- a) Water Customer Service Representative 2
- b) Civil Engineering Technician 2 (Office)

The Commission approved these items.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Special Examiners**

- a. Mardie Fritts and Michael Cossins for the Civil Engineering Technical 2 (Office) exam

The Commission approved this item.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Test Review Materials**

- a) Wastewater Collection Supervisor – Promotional Exam
- b) Water Works Maintenance Crew Leader – Promotional Exam
- c) Senior Sanitarian – Promotional Exam
- d) Laboratory Technician 3 – Promotional Exam

The Commission approved these items.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of a reclassification study (Board of Education)**

**Request for the approval of the reclassification study that was conducted on Ms. Tomlin's position of Support Specialist at Dater High School/Board of Education.** A reclassification study was conducted by the Board of Education on Ms. Heather Tomlin's position of Support Specialist with the Board of Education. Among other classification specifications included in the study was the Senior Support Specialist classification specification. The findings of the study revealed that the duties performed by Ms. Tomlin on a regular basis are classified within the Senior Support Specialist specification. The Commission tabled this item for further review and consideration.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of new and/or revised classification specifications:**

- a) Deputy Director
- b) Deputy Director (Economic Inclusion)
- c) Division Manager
- d) Parks/Recreation Programming Coordinator (Aquatics)
- e) Supervising Parks/Recreation Coordinator (Recreation)
- f) Assistant Treatment Superintendent (Capital Program Controls)

The Commission approved these items.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of Organization:**

- a) **Fire Department:** Add (1) Accounting Technician 3 and delete (1) Accounting Technician 2
- b) **Police Department:** Add (1) Crime Analyst
- c) **Police Department:** Add (1) Senior Crime Analyst
- d) **Public Services Department:** Add (1) Service Area Coordinator (Greenspace Coordinator/Scheduler)
- e) **Public Services Department:** Add (1) Clerk Typist 2 and delete (1) Electrical Maintenance Worker 1
- f) **Fire Department:** Add (1) Senior Accountant and delete (1) Administrative Specialist

The Commission approved these items.

**APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items**

**a) Appeal Hearing Schedule**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Scheduled for:</b>
David Johnson	Hearing Scheduled for March 26, 2015
Richard Johnson	Hearing Scheduled for April 23, 2015
Phillip Jones	Continuance Requested/Coordinating New Hearing Date
Robert DeBonis	Subpoenaed Documents Delivered/Hearing Date to be Scheduled
Daryl Ross	<b>Closed</b> /The City's Law Department has advised that this Appeal is Void due to the Felony Conviction of Mr. Ross in the Hamilton County Court of Common Pleas
Banita Bell (Board of Education)	Appeal Hearing to be Scheduled

The Commission noted this item.

**APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM:**

**Request from Jenell Walton to appeal the rejection of her application for the position Supervising Management Analyst (Communications).** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. Ms. Walton outlined her extensive background in the field of communications and management skills acquired from her many assignments and projects over the years. Human Resources Analyst, Bruce Ross was also present and provided information from Ms. Walton's application confirming that the application stated that she did not have management experience. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Latonya Booker to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Management Analyst (Non-Competitive).** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Dominique Bouldin to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Dental Assistant.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to her background and experience in the area. Ms. Bouldin explained that although she was just short of the one year work experience required to qualify for the position, she had completed a three-month externship with the City's Health Department to be counted towards the one year work experience. Human Resources Analyst, Doris Adotey was also present. The Commission tabled the request, pending validation of Ms. Bouldin's externship with the City.

**Request from Kamisha Bonds to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Dental Assistant.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to her background and experience in the area. Human Resources Analyst Doris Adotey, was also present and stated that the job posting was currently open until filled and that Ms. Bonds could re-apply for the position upon meeting the work experience qualification as long as the posting was still open. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Daryl Stanton to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Water Works Maintenance Crew Leader promotional exam.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. Human Resources Analyst, Ornita Brown was also present and provided information from the applicant's work history that the candidate did not meet the minimum qualifications, as he did not possess one year work experience in an eligible job classification, and was therefore not eligible to take the Water Works Maintenance Crew Leader exam. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Stephanie Woods to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Senior Accounting Technician at the Board of Education.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information outlining an extensive work history relating to her request. Ms. Margaret Key, Human Resources Consultant for Board of Education was also present. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Nancy Thompson-Glaser to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Senior Accounting Technician at the Board of Education.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information outlining an extensive work history relating to her request. Ms. Margaret Key, Human Resources Consultant for the Board of Education was also present. The Commission denied the request.

**Request for the exception to the age and education requirement for the Fire Recruit Exam Process.** The Human Resources Department, on behalf of Fire Recruit applicant, Larry Joe Green III and future applicants, requested that the Commission review the age and education requirement involving the Fire Recruit examination process. Human Resources Analyst, Nosakhare Ekhatore was present at the meeting to provide additional information relating to this request related to past practices on the Fire Recruit examination process. The Commission approved this item.



**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request to Appear Before Commission**

**Request from Granada Williams to appear before the Commission regarding matters relating to her former position as a Sanitation Helper and the Sanitation Specialist list.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission noted her concerns.

**Request from Angela White and Rodney Watts to appear before the Commission regarding matters relating to job abolishment within a unit.** Both Ms. White and Mr. Watts were present at the meeting to express their dissatisfaction with placement into their current positions following the abolishment of their former positions. Commissioner McNeal explained that the placement of a candidate following a job abolishment into a vacant position that is similar to their former position was in compliance with the AFCME Bargaining Agreement. The Commission heard their comments and noted concerns.

**Request from Sgt. Douglas Frazier to appear before the Commission regarding the review of test materials and component weights related to the Police Lieutenant exam.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission noted the request.

**Request from Jim O'Shea to appear before the Commission on the topic of Political Activity relating to financial contributions.** Mr. O'Shea was present at the meeting and stated that he was considering running for the office of Mayor in North College Hill of Greater Cincinnati, Ohio. This item was noted by the Commission and it was stated that a legal opinion would be requested from the City Solicitor's Office.

**ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:**

**Notice of the temporary assignment of Darrell Ludlow to perform work within the scope of Supervising Human Resources Analyst.** Mr. Ludlow will be assigned to perform work within the Supervising Human Resources Analyst classification to assist in the completion of process re-engineering and development. The Commission noted the information.

**Update on the Implementation of BoardDocs.** Training/Implementation of BoardDocs will begin the week of March 16, 2015. The Commission noted the information.

**Update in the matter of CASE No.: A1402917, WEITZEL vs CITY OF CINCINNATI.** The ruling to reject Lt. Weitzel's appeal of the use of Z-Scoring for the Fire Captain promotional examination given in 2013 from County Court of Common Pleas was provided to, and noted by the Commission.

**The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organization of Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5.** CODE representatives were not present at the meeting. The Commission noted the request to address all items as waived.